#### **North Yorkshire Council**

#### **Environment Directorate**

#### **Executive Members**

#### 25 August 2023

#### **Transport Focus – Train Station Ticket Office Consultation**

# Report of the Assistant Director - Highways & Transportation, Parking Services, Street Scene, Parks and Grounds

#### 1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 To update the Corporate Director of Environment and Executive Member for Highways and Transportation and provide a suggested North Yorkshire Council response to the Transport Focus – Train Station Ticket Office Consultation regarding proposals to close/reduce ticket office hours and changes to availability of staff at railway stations.

#### 2.0 SUMMARY

- 2.1 The train operators Transpennine Trains, Northern Trains, LNER and Avanti West Coast are proposing to close/reduce ticket office hours and changes to availability of staff at railway stations across the country. North Yorkshire Council (NYC) were given no prior warning of these proposals.
- 2.2 There is a process that train operators have to go through called the Ticketing and Settlement Agreement to make these changes, and as part of the process the operators are required to consult Transport Focus, the independent watchdog for transport users and it is their consultation <a href="https://tinyurl.com/bdzmcf76">https://tinyurl.com/bdzmcf76</a> that provides passengers and stakeholders with the opportunity to have their say.
- 2.3 The consultation started on 5 July and was originally meant to be completed in three weeks by 26 July 2023, however there were then numerous legal challenges raised to the consultation and the process being followed and on 26 July the consultation period was extended until 01 September 2023.
- 2.4 Transport Focus will collate and analyse the responses, and there is an email address for each of the operators and it is proposed that the same NYC letter will be sent to each email address. Transport Focus then have 35 days in which to assess the proposals and representations and at the end of that period an objection to particular proposals may be made.
- 2.5 A train company then has to decide whether or not to proceed with their proposals as set out in the consultation. If they proceed contrary to an objection, then the matter is referred to the Secretary of State for Transport.
- 2.6 This report sets out the key issues and impacts for North Yorkshire and includes the draft response to the Transport Focus consultation.

#### 3.0 BACKGROUND

- 3.1 In North Yorkshire the majority of our railway stations are already unstaffed, however the following stations currently have ticket offices and station staff available, these are:
  - Scarborough, Malton, Selby, Northallerton, Thirsk operated by Transpennine Trains,
  - Settle, Harrogate and Skipton operated by Northern
- 3.2 With the exceptions of Harrogate and Skipton all are proposed to close and staff availability in most cases will be reduced. At stations neighbouring North Yorkshire LNER propose to keep the ticket office open at York but to close Darlington, Transpennine will close the ticket offices at Middlesbrough (station staff remain), Northern will close Bridlington ticket office and Lancaster ticket office again with station staff as the alternative.
- 3.3 See Appendix A for a list of the stations and further details on the changes proposed.

#### 4.0 CONSULTATION RESPONSE

- 4.1 The NYC draft response (Appendix B) to the proposals by the train operators to close / reduce ticket office hours and changes to availability of staff at railway stations lays out the North Yorkshire Council issues and concerns at a relatively high level but does go into slightly more detail where relevant.
- 4.2 The NYC concerns include:
  - adherence to the Equality Act 2010 and NYC Equality, Diversity and Inclusion Policy
  - the proposals are premature on the basis that
    - Great British Railways as the future single organisation should be in place and take forward the proposals
    - Ticketing and fares reform to make it easier and remove complexity when purchasing rail tickets
  - Lack of detail and inconsistent approach by the train companies to the consultation
  - Lack of clarity on how the proposal will work and the roles of the station staff involved
  - Reliable access and one that enables purchase of all rail products via the sources proposed
  - How future changes to ticket office hours and staffing will be consulted
  - How train operators engage with NYC and other interested parties on the proposals going forward.
- 4.3 Whilst expressing a strong position on the proposals as they currently stand the response also seeks to provide the opportunity for dialogue between NYC and the train operators as part of an on-going process to discuss how to make best use of train station facilities in North Yorkshire.
- 4.4 An informal meeting of the Transport, Economy, Environment and Enterprise Overview & Scrutiny Committee has also taken place and the views of this committee are expected to be fed back to this meeting for inclusion within the response.

#### 5.0 ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS CONSIDERED

5.1 This is a response to a consultation and therefore there is no alternative option

#### 6.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

6.1 There are no Financial Implications

#### 7.0 LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

7.1 As this is report refers to submission of a consultation response there are no legal implications.

#### 8.0 EQUALITIES IMPLICATIONS

- 8.1 This report is North Yorkshire Council's response to ticket office closure consultation. It is not in itself a proposal and so has no impact on people with protected characteristics and so the report does not need to have a full EIA. (See Appendix C).
- 8.2 It is important to add that the consultation response has addressed the potential negative impacts of the proposal by the train operators. In particular, the local demographic in North Yorkshire, for example an aging ageing population and a large rural community. In addition, the response references the council's equality, diversity and inclusion policy.
- 8.3 The council has received representations from disability and access groups which are reflected in the response.

#### 9.0 CLIMATE CHANGE IMPLICATIONS

9.1 There are limited climate change implications, the risk covered in the NYC response is that this acts as a barrier to rail travel and people choose other modes that have greater impacts on climate change. (See Appendix D).

#### 10.0 REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATIONS

10.1 To enable a NYC response to be made to the Transport Focus – Train Station Ticket Office Consultation.

#### 11.0 RECOMMENDATION

11.1 That the Executive Member for Highways and Transportation, in consultation with the Corporate Director Environment, approves the draft NYC letter responding to the Transport Focus – Train Station Ticket Office Consultation, contained in Appendix B.

#### **APPENDICES:**

Appendix A – Table of Stations in and around North Yorkshire and the potential impact of the changes.

Appendix B – Draft NYC response to the consultation

Appendix C – Equalities Impact Assessment (EIA)

Appendix D – Climate Change Impact Assessment (CCIA)

#### **BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS: None**

#### **BARRIE MASON**

Assistant Director - Highways & Transportation, Parking Services, Street Scene, Parks and Grounds

Report Author – Graham North, Strategy and Performance Officer Presenter Of Report –Graham North, Strategy and Performance Officer

Note: Members are invited to contact the author in advance of the meeting with any detailed queries or questions.

### Appendix A

Ap	pen	dix	Α

Appelluix A																		
Stations in North Yorkshire	April 2018- March	Usage Post Pandemic April 2021- March 2022 (ORR data)	Current Ticket Office Opening Times Mon-Fri	Current Ticket Office Opening Times Sat	Current Ticket Office Opening Times Sun	Proposed Ticket Office Opening Times	Current Station Staffing Times Mon-Fri	Current Station Staffing Times Sat	Current Station Staffing Times Sun	Proposed Station Staffing Times Mon- Fri	Proposed Station Staffing Times Sat	Proposed Station Staffing Times Sun	% of all Sales at Ticket Office Last Year	% of all sales at Ticket Office April June 23	% of all ticket Office Sales Ticket National Average quoted	April -	EIA Draft all subject to consultation	Comments
York	10.1m	8.1m	06:00 20:00	06:00 20:00	00:00 10:00	Remains Open	First/Last train	First/Last train	First/Last train	First/Last train	First/Last train	First/Last train	Not	Not available	12%	Not	Overarching	
Malkan	349k	272k	06:30-19:30				06:00-20:00		09:15-20:00		08:00-15:00		avallable	INUL available	12%	available		Significant reduction in hours
Malton			05:30-19:30															5
Northallerton	712k	681k	05:30-18:30						08:00-18:45 06:00-21:00			09:00-16:00 06:00-21:00			12% 12%			Significant reduction in hours
Scarborough	973k	841k															Y	Ticket Office closes but station staffing hours do not change
Selby	675k	479k			09:15-19:00				08:45-19:15						12%		Y	Ticket Office closes but station staffing hours do not change
Thirsk	222k	209k	06:00-19:45	06:00-19:45	08:45-17:30	Closed	05:45-20:00	05:45-20:00	08:30-20:00	05:45-20:00	05:45-20:00	08:45-17:35			12%		Y	Reduction in hours on a Sunday reduces available level access times
Settle *	149k	118k	07:15-16:40	09:15-18:00	09:30-1800	Closed	07:15-16:40	09:15-18:00	09:30-18:00	09:00-13:00	09:00-13:00	Closed	32%	28%	12%	21%	Υ	Ticket Office operated in partnership with Settle & Carlisle Development Company : No staffing on a Sunday (leisure)
Skipton	1.2m	944k	05:50-18:20	05:50-18:20	09:00-16:30				09:00-16:30			09:00-17:00	23%	20%	12%	24%		Reduction of 30mins on weekdays
Harrogate	1.8m	1.2m	06:15-19:00	06:15-19:00	09:15-18:00	Remains Open	06:00-18:00	06:00-18:00	09:00-17:00	06:00-18:00	06:00-18:00	09:00-1700	12%	10%	12%	19%	Y	,
Whitby **	135k	120k	-	-	-	- '			-		-		-	-	12%	-	Y	Ticket Office operated by North Yorkshire Moors Railway
Stations bordering North Yorkship	re																	
9							First/Last	First/Last	First/Last	First/Last	First/Last	First/Last	Not			Not		
Darlington	2.4m	2.1m	08:00-16:00	08:00-16:00	08:00-16:00	Closed	train	train	train	train	train	train	available	Not available	12%	available	Overarching	
						Closed (but ticket office support available over							Not			Not	J	
Lancaster	2.1m	1.7m							09:00-2245					Not available	12%	available	Υ	
Middlesbrough	1.3m	1.2m			08:15-19:00				05:00-23:59						12%		Υ	Station staffed 24 hours
Bridlington	453k	443k	06:00-18:00	06:00-18:00	09:30-18:00	Closed	06:00-18:00	06:00-18:00	09:30-18:00	06:00-1630	06:00-16:30	09:15-18:45	29%	21%	12%	33%	Υ	

#### **Dear Transport Focus**

## Response from North Yorkshire Council to Transport Focus in relation to rail ticket office closure consultation - July 2023

North Yorkshire Council (NYC) is supportive of the overarching principle of reforming railway station operations and recognises the move to digital retailing of tickets over the last decade which has accelerated throughout the recent pandemic period. However, we cannot accept the de-staffing of railway stations in North Yorkshire nor nationally as currently set out within the proposals.

The proposed closures in or near to North Yorkshire of the ticket offices at Scarborough, Malton, Selby, Northallerton, Thirsk and Middlesbrough railway stations by Transpennine Trains, Settle and Bridlington stations by Northern, Darlington station by LNER, and Lancaster station by Avanti West Coast is considered to be a retrograde step and a future barrier to travel by rail.

The proposed reduction in staffing times at most stations in North Yorkshire is a concern for our residents with many passenger facilities such as waiting rooms and toilets being opened later and closed earlier than they are currently. Malton and Northallerton are examples of this and at Thirsk the proposals reduce the time the station is accessible. Many stations in North Yorkshire are remote and there have been concerns raised about the safety and security of these stations especially during the hours of darkness. At a time when leisure travel is increasing it is also disappointing to see that there will be no availability of staff from 1300 Monday to Saturday at Settle station, nor at all on a Sunday.

The ticket offices that are proposed to remain open, including York as well as Harrogate and Skipton seem to indicate a lack of consistency in the decision-making process as to which ticket offices remain open given that ticket offices with similar footfall in North Yorkshire are proposed to close. There are also concerns that those that stay open will see an increase in use as others close and with the reduction in ticket office opening times, and no indication within the consultation of the number of staff or facilities available this will lead to significant queues.

NYC have received representations from disability and access groups, and we have suggested that these groups respond to the consultation directly as well as raising their concerns in this response. There would appear to have only been draft or overarching Equality Impact Assessments carried out for this consultation, with some being provided well into the revised consultation process and after the original closure date. NYC would expect the rail industry in making any decisions on ticket office closures in North Yorkshire to comply with the Council's equality, diversity and inclusion policy <a href="https://tinyurl.com/4ccs382">https://tinyurl.com/4ccs382</a>. There have also been concerns raised that the consultation itself is not compliant as some of the information has not been made available in an accessible format, and there are similar concerns about any future consultations.

The incomplete and in some places inaccurate information provided in the consultation makes it difficult to make an informed response, and whilst appreciating the changes in how people purchase rail tickets post pandemic, ticket offices carry out a valued service to those who use them that is far beyond ticket sales and not easily replicated by those on platforms. Further, in some areas of North Yorkshire, we believe that ticket office sales are significantly higher than those quoted in the consultation we would suggest this can be accounted for in four main ways as our stations serve:

- an ageing population
- areas of deprivation

- rural hinterlands where there is still poor digital connectivity and this proposal could add to issues around rural isolation
- York and North Yorkshire are significant visitor destinations, and many are not familiar with the rail services and what is available to them.

Whilst the consultation is specific to train operators four of which are directly relevant to North Yorkshire, the proposals on ticket offices closures across England creates an additional barrier for occasional, leisure and disabled passengers to use rail travel to York and North Yorkshire which in turn potentially impacts on the visitor and leisure economy.

We would also note that as part of the establishment of Great British Railways they were proposed to operate stations and this would have meant a co-ordinated approach to this consultation would have been undertaken.

The consultation appears to also be premature as it should be undertaken only after work on ticketing and fares reform was completed. We support this work and agree that the current way fares are presented is complex and leads to uncertainty as to whether the passenger is confident that the correct and best fare is offered and therefore provides confidence before travelling. Alongside this is the issue that not all fares or rail products including railcards are shown on the rail ticketing and information systems available to the public.

The proposals contain a strong reliance on technology and especially Ticket Vending Machines (TVM's) at stations, and despite the lack of more detailed information being made available in the consultation the following concerns are highlighted

- The unreliability of the TVM's has been frequently raised
- What are the processes in place, including timescales, to fix a TVM
- How will on-board staff be made aware so that the appropriate fare is charged and penalty fares are not issued
- Will TVM's be able to sell tickets beyond the day of travel
- What fares and products are available at a TVM or similar
- Will the fares offered be impartial or focused on the station operator
- Accessibility of TVM's

School children have raised the issue of scholar's season tickets with the Council and the process relies on the ticket office as there are forms and procedures that need completing. This would also be at specific times of the year and potentially create significant peaks for any station staff.

The proposals for staff at stations require further clarification on;

- stations that are resourced for quite short periods of the day with no specific times
- future roles, responsibilities and priorities
- the information on the number of staff available
- as to what happens during leave, sickness, etc.,
- the process that needs to be agreed to make any changes to these arrangements in the future
- how these specific staff will be easily identified by passengers across the rail network

Stations act as gateways to our cities, towns and countryside and it is important that reassurances are given that any ticket offices or other station facilities that are closed are still regularly maintained to a high standard to ensure that stations in North Yorkshire can continue to offer the best welcome to the people that use them and the communities they serve. And any proposed closure of a ticket office should first consider whether there are 3<sup>rd</sup> party opportunities to use the office in the future and make the process to enable this as easy as possible.

In summary, for the reasons outlined above North Yorkshire Council cannot agree to the current proposals however will work constructively with the rail industry on how to make best use of all the station facilities and staffing resources at stations in North Yorkshire. Finally, there are specific local issues that require further discussion including for example at Northallerton and arrangements at stations between 3<sup>rd</sup> parties and the rail industry which the Council would also want to discuss further with the rail industry.

Initial equality impact assessment screening form

This form records an equality screening process to determine the relevance of equality to a proposal, and a decision whether or not a full EIA would be appropriate or proportionate.

Directorate	Environment
Service area	Transport Planning
Proposal being screened	Response to Transport Focus – Train Station Ticket
	Office Consultation.
Officer(s) carrying out screening	Graham North
What are you proposing to do?	Respond to the above consultation expressing our concerns around the proposals including the <u>draft</u> EIA assessments the rail industry have carried out, see attached Report and Draft letter.  Nationally there are legal challenges (we understand including disability groups) to the Transport Focus – Train Station Ticket Office Consultation and the proposals contained therein.
Why are you proposing this? What are the desired outcomes?	To ensure that NYC formally respond to the consultation and are part of the process going forward. The ultimate decision for the changes proposed is with the Secretary of State for Transport.
Does the proposal involve a significant commitment or removal of resources? Please give details.	Not for North Yorkshire Council. However, the consultation will remove most rail ticket offices in North Yorkshire and at most stations reduce station staff availability. This is likely to impact on accessibility to rail services.

Impact on people with any of the following protected characteristics as defined by the Equality Act 2010, or NYC's additional agreed characteristics

As part of this assessment, please consider the following questions:

- To what extent is this service used by particular groups of people with protected characteristics?
- Does the proposal relate to functions that previous consultation has identified as important?
- Do different groups have different needs or experiences in the area the proposal relates to?

If for any characteristic it is considered that there is likely to be an adverse impact or you have ticked 'Don't know/no info available', then a full EIA should be carried out where this is proportionate. You are advised to speak to your directorate representative for advice if you are in any doubt.

Protected characteristic	Potential	Don't know/No	
	Yes	No	info available
Age	Yes		
Disability	Yes		
Sex	Yes		
Race	Yes		
Sexual orientation		No	
Gender reassignment		No	
Religion or belief		No	

Pregnancy or maternity	Yes					
Marriage or civil partnership		No				
		•		•		
People in rural areas	Yes					
People on a low income	Yes					
Carer (unpaid family or friend)	Yes					
Are from the Armed Forces Community	Yes					
Does the proposal relate to an area where there are known inequalities/probable impacts (for example, disabled people's access to public transport)? Please give details.	Yes, access to purchase rail tickets / products may mean someone or another organisation to provide the help / assistance.  Access to purchase tickets / products and to use stations where rail staff currently provide assistance is reduced or withdrawn at some locations.					
Will the proposal have a significant effect on how other organisations operate? (for example, partners, funding criteria, etc.). Do any of these organisations support people with protected characteristics? Please explain why you have reached this conclusion.	Yes, access to mean someone provide the help	or anot	ther organ	ets / pro nisation	ducts may has to	
Decision (Please tick one option)	EIA not relevant or proportionate:	✓	Continue EIA:	e to full		
Reason for decision	This report is North Yorkshire Council's response to ticket office closure consultation. It is not in itsel a proposal and so has no impact on people with protected characteristics. This is the reason that the report does not need to have a full EIA.  It is important to add that the consultation respons has addressed the potential negative impacts of the proposal by the train operators. In particular, the local demographic in North Yorkshire, for example an aging ageing population and a large rural community. In addition, the response references the council's equality,  The council has received representations from disability and access groups which are reflected in the response.					
Signed (Assistant Director or equivalent)	Barrie Mason					
Date	10/08/23					

#### Climate change impact assessment

The purpose of this assessment is to help us understand the likely impacts of our decisions on the environment of North Yorkshire and on our aspiration to achieve net carbon neutrality by 2030, or as close to that date as possible. The intention is to mitigate negative effects and identify projects which will have positive effects.

This document should be completed in consultation with the supporting guidance. The final document will be published as part of the decision making process and should be written in Plain English.

If you have any additional queries which are not covered by the guidance please email <a href="mailto:climatechange@northyorks.gov.uk">climatechange@northyorks.gov.uk</a>

Please note: You may not need to undertake this assessment if your proposal will be subject to any of the following:

Planning Permission

**Environmental Impact Assessment** 

Strategic Environmental Assessment

However, you will still need to summarise your findings in in the summary section of the form below.

Please contact climatechange@northyorks.gov.uk for advice.

Title of proposal	Response to Transport Focus – Train Station Ticket Office Consultation.
Brief description of proposal	Respond to the above consultation expressing our concerns around the proposals including the <u>draft</u> EIA assessments the rail industry have carried out, see attached Report and Draft letter.
Directorate	Environment
Service area	Highways and Transportation
Lead officer	Graham North
Names and roles of other people involved in	
carrying out the impact assessment	
Date impact assessment started	04/08/2023

#### **Options appraisal**

Were any other options considered in trying to achieve the aim of this project? If so, please give brief details and explain why alternative options were not progressed.

This is a response to the Transport Focus – Train Station Ticket Office Consultation to ensure that NYC formally respond to the consultation and are part of the process going forward. The ultimate decision for the changes proposed is with the Secretary of State for Transport. There have been no discussions on the proposals before the Consultation started.

What impact will this proposal have on council budgets? Will it be cost neutral, have increased cost or reduce costs?

Please explain briefly why this will be the result, detailing estimated savings or costs where this is possible.

This is a consultation by organisations outside of North Yorkshire Council and there will be no impact on council budgets.

How will this proposal in the environment?  N.B. There may be short negative impact and lon positive impact. Please potential impacts over tof a project and provide explanation.	t term ger term include all he lifetime	Positive impact (Place a X in the box below where	No impact (Place a X in the box below where	Negative impact (Place a X in the box below where	Explain why will it have this effect and over what timescale?  Where possible/relevant please include:  Changes over and above business as usual  Evidence or measurement of effect  Figures for CO <sub>2</sub> e  Links to relevant documents	Explain how you plan to mitigate any negative impacts.	Explain how you plan to improve any positive outcomes as far as possible.
Minimise greenhouse gas emissions e.g. reducing emissions from travel, increasing energy efficiencies etc.	Emissions from travel			X	Closure of railway ticket offices and alternative ways of selling tickets and reduced availability of staff, is likely to act as a barrier to some people using rail and using other transport modes that may not be as carbon friendly.	Responding to the Transport Focus – Train Station Ticket Office Consultation. https://tinyurl.com/bdzmcf76	It is for the rail industry to respond to the consultation and NYC have said we will work with the industry. Ultimately the decision is with the Secretary of State for Transport.
	Emissions from constructio n		X				•
	Emissions from running of buildings Other		X				

How will this proposal impact on the environment?  N.B. There may be short term negative impact and longer term positive impact. Please include all potential impacts over the lifetime of a project and provide an explanation.	Positive impact (Place a X in the box below where	a X	Negative impact (Place a X in the box below where	Explain why will it have this effect and over what timescale?  Where possible/relevant please include:  Changes over and above business as usual  Evidence or measurement of effect  Figures for CO <sub>2</sub> e  Links to relevant documents	Explain how you plan to mitigate any negative impacts.	Explain how you plan to improve any positive outcomes as far as possible.
Minimise waste: Reduce, reuse, recycle and compost e.g. reducing use of single use plastic		Х				
Reduce water consumption		Х				
Minimise <b>pollution</b> (including air, land, water, light and noise)			Х	Closure of railway ticket offices and alternative ways of selling tickets and reduced availability of staff, is likely to act as a barrier to some people using rail and using other transport modes that may not be as carbon friendly.	Responding to the Transport Focus – Train Station Ticket Office Consultation.	It is for the rail industry to respond to the consultation and NYC have said we will work with the industry. Ultimately the decision is with the Secretary of State for Transport.
Ensure <b>resilience</b> to the effects of climate change e.g. reducing flood risk, mitigating effects of drier, hotter summers		X				•

How will this proposal impact on the environment?  N.B. There may be short term negative impact and longer term positive impact. Please include all potential impacts over the lifetime of a project and provide an explanation.	Positive impact (Place a X in the box below where	box below	Negative impact (Place a X in the box below where	Explain why will it have this effect and over what timescale?  Where possible/relevant please include:  • Changes over and above business as usual  • Evidence or measurement of effect  • Figures for CO <sub>2</sub> e  • Links to relevant documents	Explain how you plan to mitigate any negative impacts.	Explain how you plan to improve any positive outcomes as far as possible.
Enhance <b>conservation</b> and wildlife		X				
Safeguard the distinctive characteristics, features and special qualities of North Yorkshire's landscape		Х				
Other (please state below)		Х				

Are there any recognised good practice environmental standards in relation to this proposal? If so, please detail how this proposal meets those standards.

N/A

**Summary** Summarise the findings of your impact assessment, including impacts, the recommendation in relation to addressing impacts, including any legal advice, and next steps. This summary should be used as part of the report to the decision maker.

Closure of railway ticket offices and alternative ways of selling tickets and reduced availability of staff, is likely to act as a barrier to some people using rail and using other transport modes that may not be as carbon friendly. It is for the rail industry to respond to the consultation and NYC have said we will work with the industry. Ultimately the decision is with the Secretary of State for Transport.

#### Sign off section

This climate change impact assessment was completed by:

Name	Graham North	
Job title	Strategy and Performance Officer	
Service area	On behalf of Highways and Transportation	
Directorate	Environment	
Signature	G G North	
Completion date	04/08/2023	

Authorised by relevant Assistant Director (signature): Barrie Mason

Date: 10/08/23